

Joshua Smith

Sierra Club submits the attached comments of members and supporters on the Texas Commission of Environmental Quality's ("TCEQ's") proposed attainment demonstration state implementation plan for the Houston-Galveston-Brazoria ("HGB") nonattainment area under the 2008 national ambient air quality standard for ozone. Sierra Club members and supporters live, work, recreate, own businesses, and breathe the air in the HGB nonattainment area and are directly and adversely affected by ground-level smog. As the attached comments make clear, Texas's persistent and decades-long nonattainment crisis has real-world, everyday impacts on families, businesses, and tourism.



January 16, 2024

VIA THE TCEQ PUBLIC COMMENT SYSTEM

Denine Calvin
MC 206
State Implementation Plan Team
Air Quality Division, TCEQ
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, TX-78711-3087

Laurie Gharis
Chief Clerk, MC 105
TCEQ
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, TX 78711-3087

RE: Public Comments regarding Houston-Galveston-Brazoria (HGB) Severe Area Attainment Demonstration (AD) State Implementation Plan (SIP) Revision for the 2008 Eight-Hour Ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS), Docket No. 2023-1223-SIP/Project No. 2023-110-SIP-NR

Dear Chief Clerk and Air Quality State Implementation Plan Team,

Sierra Club submits the attached comments of members and supporters on the Texas Commission of Environmental Quality's ("TCEQ's") proposed attainment demonstration state implementation plan for the Houston-Galveston-Brazoria ("HGB") nonattainment area under the 2008 national ambient air quality standard for ozone. Sierra Club members and supporters live, work, recreate, own businesses, and breathe the air in the HGB nonattainment area and are directly and adversely affected by ground-level smog. As the attached comments make clear, Texas's persistent and decades-long nonattainment crisis has real-world, everyday impacts on families, businesses, and tourism.

/s/Joshua Smith
Staff Attorney
Sierra Club
2101 Webster Street, Suite 1300
Oakland, CA 94612
joshua.smith@sierraclub.org
(415) 977-5560

Re: Houston-Glaveston-Brazoria Comments on Docket No. 2023-110-SIP-NR

To Whom it May Concern:

I urge TCEQ to implement the most stringent possible plan to bring the Houston-Galveston-Brazoria nonattainment area back into attainment for ozone pollution in accordance with the 2008 National Ambient Air Quality Standards and as is required by the Clean Air Act. In the HGB area, a group of large industrial plants – including the WA Parish coal plant, oil refineries, and chemical and petrochemical plants – are the biggest ozone-precursor sources and need to reduce both VOCs and NOx emissions. NRG's Parish coal plant in Fort Bend County is by far the No. 1 source of NOx pollution. ExxonMobil's Baytown complex of the oil refinery and chemical and petrochemical plants is the largest source of VOC pollution. A 2023 ozone report published by the Environmental Integrity Project identified six Houston areas where residents were exposed to the highest levels of ozone in 2023 at 100 ppb (the 2008 standard is 75 ppb). It is also explained that more than 90 percent of the residents in four of these areas are people of color, and that about 50 percent of these households are low income. Overall, their data shows that people of color and low income households in Houston are more likely to be exposed to ozone concentrations that are higher than the federal standard and the least likely to have been improved since these standards were set in 2008 (1). A large part of the nonattainment problem in Texas is related to increased temperatures, because the summers are getting hotter as the climate crisis is exacerbated by continued reliance on fossil fuels and a failure to appropriately regulate polluting industries in general. A recent story from the Sierra Club identified that nearly half of the Texas population is consistently exposed to unsafe levels of ozone pollution (2). That's nearly 15 million people who could be at risk. This is a public health crisis that TCEQ must address before it worsens. Additionally, a serious concern that I have regarding TCEQ's plan pertains to tailpipe testing fraud and TCEQ's vehicle I/M program. There have been reports that fraudulent inspectors can use a simulator device similar to a flash drive that plugs into the emissions analyzer instead of the car. The device simulates a car's onboard diagnostic system and can be programmed to guarantee a passing result (3). Texas investigators believe millions of cars on Texas roads never actually passed state-required safety or emissions tests. Yet, those cars were able to get temporary paper license plates, or even regular metal plates, by paying an inspection station to fraudulently pass the car. Even more concerning is the fact that these reports found the state's inspection computer system is not programmed to catch fake inspections and immediately stop them. TCEQ needs to work more closely with local law enforcement agencies and the Texas Department of Public Safety to stop fraudulent tail pipe inspections. Texans are facing the very real and dangerous consequences of TCEQ's failure to submit state plans that meet the federal requirements for NAAQS, so we expect you all to do your due diligence and provide the most stringent regulations with these revisions to the 2008 plan.

Thank you for your consideration.

1. <https://subscriber.politicopro.com/eenews/f/eenews/?id=0000018c-17ba-dbbc-a1de-7ffedcd10000>

2. <https://www.sierraclub.org/texas/blog/2023/11/more-half-texans-live-areas-unsafe-ozone-levels-which-rise-temperatures>

3. <https://www.nbcdfw.com/investigations/fake-inspections-real-license-plates-investigators-believe-millions-of-texas-cars-were-never-checked-for-safety-emissions/3220698/>

1. Jere Douglas
Houston, TX 77083

2. Jeffrey Weaver

Houston, TX 77043

. Y children a d grandchildren would appreciate a better quality of air than what we're experiencing today. Thank you.

3. Elizabeth Kelch

GreenCoveSprings, FL 32043

Texans need the TCEQ to better regulate Ozone pollution!

4. Art Hanson

Lansing, MI 48917

However, you MUST do MUCH MORE. We MUST keep ALL Climate-Changing fossil fuels IN THE GROUND! We MUST achieve 100% Clean, Renewable Energy like Solar and Wind in electrical generation and transportation by 2030.

5. Lili Flores

Houston, TX 77089

We need to take care of nature and that includes us humans. We need to breathe better quality air to prevent more sicknesses. Our best decisions make a better world to live in.

6. DARRELL NEINAST

Seguin, TX 78155

7. Shana Breeden

Houston, TX 77021

I am tired of Houston having terrible air quality days where I can?t even go outside when the weather is nice. Address the pollution problem in Texas now!!

8. Lisa Stone

Houston, TX 77096

You decide what's more important: overall human health or a few individuals' increased profit.

9. Lorraine Stehn

McAllen, TX 78504

I am an MDAnderson cancer patient and have to be treated in Houston monthly. I notice the reduced air quality with each visit I develop a sore throat.

10. David Mulcihy

Nassau Bay, TX 77058

I get tired of not being able to breathe.

11. Matt Helton

Woodway, TX 76712

My life's goal is to leave a cleaner, healthier world for my children. Regulating and reducing smog in population dense areas is a critical step in that work. Texans everywhere deserve clean air.

12. Brant Kotch
Houston, TX 77024

13. Sherry Stover-Volker
Eastampton Township, NJ 08060

14. irene Williams
DIME BOX, TX 77853
Please do something about the atrocities that have been placed upon this beautiful planet. The air is horribly disturbing in texas

15. Sharon Towsley
Chicamauga, GA 30707
Time to fix the ozone problem before bigger problems of bad health for everyone. This land is beautiful keep it that way.

16. J Cuci
Orland Park, IL 60467
STOP THE PSYCHOPATHIC TREATMENT OF OUR ENVIRONMENT!

17. Alyssa Clemenzi
Boulder, CO 80305

18. Mona Lonergan
RichmondI, VA 23229
I have friends living in Houston along with their children and grandchildren. Please help these highly educated people 3 of whom are in the health care industry, that you will take their pulmonary health seriously.

19. Joan E Maccari
Madison, NJ 07940

20. Ann Hanna
LUMBERTON, NC 28360
Please ensure that the 2008 air quality standard requirements are being upheld by the clean air act in Texas, this effects us all and we are tired of big corporations being able to pay to get standards undone removed or paying enough to simply gave thrm ignored

21. H. Dennis Shumaker
Cornwall, PA 17016

22. Kim Ward

Houston, TX 77008

This matters for future generations to live a healthy life. With all the refineries aging and failing it's more important than ever. Also government deregulation hasn't helped.

23. Erin Foret

Martinez, CA 94553

24. Cardin Tran

Houston, TX 77086

I haven't experienced enough of the effects of air pollution to warrant that we need immediate and broad changes to how we handle air quality management, but I'd say that the air quality is definitely not near ideal and that we need to start making small adjustments within the next 2 years that target the improvement of air quality.

25. Jean Chagnon

New York, NY 10001

urgency

26. Karen Trearchis

Dracut, MA 01826

27. Mary Ruiz

Houston AWESOME, TX 77034

Regulations on industrial pollution must be implemented in order to improve air and environmental quality for the health of our citizens.

28. Maria Coleman

Tempe, AZ 85282

Contact me right away

29. Jim Dailey

Woburn, MA 01801

30. Richard Woodward

Houston, TX 77095

Enforcement of noncompliance issues in the Tri-County area by TCEQ is a joke. How can the agency regain public confidence and trust? One. Strong publication of frequent excursion monitoring to raise public awareness of the polluted air. We all share. Two. Strong action plans to regulate polluters on high excursion days. Let's see limitations on transport, restrictions on refining activity and flaring, reduction in major cold, burning polluting industries like power generation. Three. Recent large scale chemical fires in the Tri-County area have made TCEQ look ridiculous. When they wave an air monitor saying the air is safe to breathe, and there are huge

columns of particulates, VOCs and combustion products ballooning from the fire. Let's see some reporting of what's in that smoke, what do you exposure is downwind and prognosis for eventual impact. Let's see some honesty and transparency in air monitoring.

31. Alicea Townsend
HOUSTON, TX 77059

I live in Houston near NASA and for the last few years the plants have been releasing more dangerous chemicals every year. You can ask anyone in the Clear Lake, League City, South Houston, Pasadena or even Galveston, it is getting worse and causing health problems for many of us. I understand that many of you see no other way other than this way but it does come at a cost to the quality of our lives. These plants do it early in the morning or very late in the evening to avoid being caught. Enforce, put harsher penalties, and fund the departments that regulate these issues.

32. Jason Matsumoto
Galveston, TX 77551

Come on. We have to get our act together as a state and country to lessen the pain we will experience from climate change. These rules are a drop in the bucket.

33. Earl Poteet
Pueblo West, CO 81007

34. Ed Perry
New Braunfels, TX 78132
We all need clean air and it is our right.

35. Lynds Pickett
Lakewood, CO 80232

36. gisela zech
boise, ID 83706

37. Sam Godwin
Salt Lake City, UT 84105

38. Cathryne Kimura
Aurora, CO 80013

39. Brenda Crazy Bull
Kuna, ID 83634

40. Teresa Phillips
Fort Collins, CO 80525

41. Heather Vasquez
Denver, CO 80238

42. Gayla Smith
Mesquite, TX 75181

43. Gai Lawsen
Durango, CO 81301
Climate engineering, aerosols, kill ozone!

44. Cameron McElroy
Richland, WA 99352

45. Diane Danby
Longmont, CO 8054

46. Teresa Phillips
Fort Collins, CO 80525

47. tom stiles
snowmass vlg, CO 81615

48. Michael Vecchio
Houston, TX 77025
I strongly support measures that will reduce annual air pollutant loading in the Houston area. They should be modified to become more stringent as population grows yo level and eventually reduce annual loading rates.

49. Donna Rhodes
Boulder, CO 80301

50. Jax Sprague
Seattle, WA 98101

51. Sherrilyn Drew
Des Plaines, IL 60016

52. Keely Chow
Bellaire, TX 77401

53. Sandy Schott
Kalispell, MT 59901
ATTENTION: We need better regulation of ozone pollution so that we can breathe cleaner air? Right now the SIP ? or State Implementation Plan ? revisions are underway. Cities like Houston,

Galveston, and Brazoria, named the worst-offending areas for severe air pollution, need to make updates to these plans created by states to meet air quality standards. These revisions are often needed due to the changing conditions of our environment and the need to find more efficient ways to control emissions and monitor air quality to protect public health.

54. Alida Bockino
Moscow, ID 83843

55. Karen Kenia
Factoryville, PA 18419

56. Kimberley Usher-Duve
Bedias, TX 77831

57. Emily Boone
Louisville, KY 40206

58. Stephen Nutt
Arlington/Dallas, TX 76015

59. Richard Vultaggio
Vestal, NY 13850

60. Susan Pitiger
Vashon, WA 98070

61. Barbara Smith
Memphis, TN 38111

62. David Klingensmith
Eugene, OR 97401

63. Pam Harper-Smith
College Station, TX 77840

64. Caroline Mead
Glenview, IL 60025

65. John Jumonville
San Antonio TX, TX 78247

66. Valarie Matinjussi
Bellingham, WA 98225

67. Darryl Warner

far rockaway, NY 11693

we need to protect the ozone;it is a life force for all humanity and nature.

68. Stephanie Stallings

Houston, TX 77077

In summer 2023, there were ozone action days during daytime hours almost continuously. I had to delay my evening walks to avoid harm from ozone. At times, ozone action days even extended past sunset. There have been times I felt an itch in my eyes and throat on evening walks, and I believe it may have been ozone or other air pollution. Summer 2023 also had heat advisory/heat wave warnings on most days, and even until September. I've read that 2023 was the hottest year yet, breaking or tying with multiple records. I worry I may have to leave Houston sometime in the next 10 years for my own safety to avoid heat stroke: after all, heat waves are the deadliest natural disaster.

69. Ric Watkins

Phoenix, AZ 85033

I lived and worked in Texas for many years. Life there has deteriorated due to corrupt political and government policies designed to keep offensive people in power. I am glad I was able to move out of the state.

70. Monique Hahn

Gates Mills, OH 44040

71. Carol Schmidt

Sidney, OH 45365

72. Kathleen Herrera

Edgewater, CO 80214

Help people

73. Linda Fielder

Carrollton, TX 75006

It's time the TCEQ actually DID something to protect the health of Texans. Stop allowing polluters to pollute our air, land

74. Ricki Gardner

Sachse, TX 75048

Please stop polluting our air!

75. Marilyn Mooshie

Selma, OR 97538

76. Sandra Donahue

North Andover, MA 01845

77. Robert Clark
W. Covina, CA 91791

78. Connie Kendall
Springfield, OH 45503

79. Erh-Yen To
Sacramento, CA 95835

80. Jerry Tobe
Los Angeles, CA 90034

May you do ONLY that which is truly best for the vast majority of people living in Texas and cause those people as little harm as humanly possible. Thank you for your consideration.

81. Paul Clinch
Oak Brook, IL 60523

82. Jean Cameron
Gainesville, FL 32606

83. Jean Cameron
Gainesville, FL 32606

84. Nancy Gathing
Madison, WI 53714

85. Linda Stock
I, CA 90630

I grew up in Long Beach, CA, in the 50's, with smog so bad it burned your skin and eyes and lungs. It made holes in my nylons. If it does that to material, what does it do to the cells in our lungs? Don't you want to breathe air that meets air quality standards. Your money doesn't do any good when you are on your deathbed.

86. EILEEN MILLAN
NY, NY 10011
please work on this immediately

87. linda kitchen
Oak Park, IL 60304

88. Terrillyn A. Geer
Pittsfield, MA 01201

89. Keely Chow
Bellaire, TX 77401

90. Karen Loeser
Mercer Island, MS 98040

91. Bonnie Mccann
Katy, TX 77494

92. Theresa Gerace
Langhorne, PA 19047

93. Marilyn Shepherd
Trinidad, CA 95570

94. Robert Kelley
Conroe, TX 77304

95. Donald Smith
st Johnsbury, VT 05819

96. Marian McCurdy
Bulverde, TX 78163

I am a Texan and am not proud of how we are not doing better to curb ozone pollution.

97. Michele Dawn Sanderson
Walnut Creek, CA 94595

thank you very much for making sure our air is good for our health all over the world including the USA, very important for the health of humanity and the earth in general

98. Susan Lewis
Evergreen, CO 80439

99. Lisa Perrotta
Newton, MA 02458

100. Margaret Goodwin
West Haven ct, CT 06516
we have to pay attention to ozone

101. Eric Zinn
Brooklyn, NY 11210

102. Veronica Waller
Crosby, TX 77532

103. Janice Barker
Alliance, OH 44601

104. Ruth Zemek
Phoenix, AZ 85018
wake up, TEXAS!!

105. Lori Jackson
Shelbyville, KY 40065
We need to protect our air. Please help us do this!

106. Diane Langejans
Irvine, CA 92606
This issue matters to me because the lack of regulation of ozone pollution from industrial and fossil fuels puts people at greater risk. The increasing of ozone exposure will lead to more severe respiratory problems, hotter summers, and increased greenhouse gases damaging our atmosphere. Pollution has effected me because I have lived through the years when there used to be no protections placed in gasoline. The high concentrations of lead used to make my lungs ache and hurt from being in town of Los Angeles. The pollution from leaded gasoline affected me in an adverse manner. The cities of Houston, Galveston, and Brazoria, need to make updates to their plans created by states, to meet air quality standards that will make pristine and clean air quality standards. The public's health matters. The fact that the TCEQ has failed to submit good state plans to meet federal ozone standards for 15 years is completely unacceptable. The air we breathe matters to our lungs & to our planet.

107. rose moore
yale, MI 48097

108. George Bannister
New York, NY 10002

109. Sandra MS Cheng
Renton, WA 98056

110. David Straka
Evansville, IN 47720

111. Matthew Miller
PITTSBURGH, PA 15227

112. Fran Aguirre

Denver, CO 80211

Please pass this legislation. The wind blow ozone from Teas to Colorado. It adds to what is already here!

113. SUSAN TATRO
EUREKA, CA 95503

114. Greg Sells
Austin, TX 78741

115. KERRY KREBILL
CLANCY, MT 59634

116. Benjamin Bingaman
Trabuco Canyon, CA 92679

117. Kayt Wolfe
Marietta, GA 30068

Every state and every country around the world needs to take immediate action to protect the environment. Do your part by addressing the ozone issue.

118. Nancy S Sidebotham
Oakland, CA 94605

119. Ron Gilliland
Herndon, VA 20170

120. Margaret Lauer
Clearwater, FL 33756

121. Bob Love
Little Egg Harbor, NJ 08087
Clean air is needed

122. Darlene Knox
Sisters, OR 97759

123. Mark Lessner
Lake Havasu City, AZ 86403

124. Thomas Gilmore
Bellingham, WA 98225
Texas needs to improve air quality regulations!

125. Craig Rudolph
NORTH ROYALTON, OH 44133

126. Monica Bayles
Omaha, NE 68154

127. Margarita Latimer
Miami Beach, FL 33140

128. Painter Who Touch Isa House Nnnn
I?m in, CA 93619
Hi

129. Hedwig Raskob
Kendall, NY 14476
Myself wanting to be able to breath, so I want others to breathe and live.

130. Victoria Soli
Houston, TX 77025

131. Ricardo Amaya
Houston, TX 77038

132. Jonathan Connor
Westfield, NJ 07090
Please tell Texas to regulate their emissions and prevent a global catastrophe.

133. Janeene Porcher
Golden, CO 80401

134. Jordan Burress
Bella Vista, AR 72715

135. alicia kautz
44691, OH 44691

136. Matas Aleksas
New Fairfield, CT 06812

137. Chrysanthi Lawrence
Houston, TX 77030
Houstonians are in desperate need of better air quality!

138. Jennie Rohrer

Houston, TX 77007

139. S. R.
Bogart, GA 30622

140. Steven Viola
New York, NY 10011

141. Anna Sergeeva
Houston., TX 77025

142. Dale Goldstein
Levittown, NY 11756

143. Robert Stark
Houston, TX 77062

144. Anthony Carreon
Antioch, CA 94509
This is extremely important to me!!!!

145. RICHARD PENA
San Antonio, TX 78249
TIME TO STOP THE GOP OZONE POLLUTION IT IS HURTING THE CHILDREN OF THE FUTURE.

146. Dianne Brause
Satellite Beach, FL 32937

147. Steven Cook
Seminole, FL 33778

148. Edward Laurson
Denver, CO 80235
I'm tired of dirty air, car pollution and chemicals harming our waterways.

149. Marie Herron
Wildwood Crest, NJ 08260

150. Jon Jarvis
Las Vegas, NV 89130

151. Chris Calvert
Santa Fe, NM 87501

152. Jody Mahnken
Boise, ID 83713

As a person with a respiratory problem, the increase in ozone exposure will lead to more severe respiratory problems and hotter summers unless we take collective action! the increase in ozone exposure will lead to more severe respiratory problems and hotter summers unless we take collective action! The increase in ozone exposure will lead to more severe respiratory problems and hotter summers unless we take collective action!Limit ozone and Restore the breath of life.

153. Patty Navarrete
Taos, NM 87571

154. Jill Van Cise
Los Angeles, CA 90057

155. Jill Van Cise
Los Angeles, CA 90057

156. Jill Van Cise
Los Angeles, CA 90057

157. Kerry Krebill
Clancy, MT 59634

158. Dennis Bahr
Snohomish, WA 98296

159. Janet Swihart
Long Beach, WA 98631
Texas needs all the help it can get.

160. Michael Lee
Peoria, AZ 85383

161. Michael Gan
Kennewick, WA 99336

162. David Morrison
Albuquerque, NM 87107

163. Michael Shores
Tempe, AZ 85281

164. Alice Petersen

Toledo, OH 43623

165. Amy Harrison
Murrieta, CA 92562

166. Karen Loeser
Mercer Island, WA 98040

167. linda kitchen
Oak Park, IL 60304

168. Virginia Simon
Houston, TX 77063

169. Karen O'Rourke
Canoga Park, CA 91304

170. Martin Martin
Brooklyn, NY 11235

171. Rebecca Sanne
Great Falls, MT 59404

172. M H
Pittsburgh, PA 15218

173. Claire Buckley
Portland, OR 76051

As a local Texan, I care deeply about the ability for us to all partake in our natural right to clean air. And if we can do something about the health and safety then that is absolutely what should be done!

174. Cary West
Burnet, TX 78611

175. fred munger
littleton, CO 80123
we need to get active, our future is at stake

176. Ann Rosenwinkel
Houston, TX 77025

My daughter suffers from asthma and it is exacerbated by the lack of regulations on ozone levels. Please help us all to be able to breathe easy in Texas.

177. Cindy Santi
Weatherford, TX 76087
Breath clean air

178. Linda White
, - 77511

179. Andrew Holdaway
Houston, TX 77019
This needs to be addressed by policy makers ASAP.